

Appendix D: Willamette PAC Authorization and Recommendations of Waldo Lake Subcommittee

WILLAMETTE PROVINCE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Meeting Notes

April 9, 1998

ATTENDANCE

Members Present: Denis Williamson (Chair), Herb Wick (for Darrel Kenops), Lorna Stickel, Wade Stampe, Cole Gardiner, Cliff Adams, Russ Peterson, Wayne Geisy, Dave Schmidt, Robert Buckman, Art Mancel, Ellie Dumdi, Mark Shaw, Neal Forrester (Designate Federal Official).

Member Absent: Michael Rylko, Gary Varner, Michelle Day, Joe Evans, Olney Itatt, Judie Hamerstad, Ross Mickey, Dick Vander Schaff, Jeff Kohnstamm, Scott Pineo, Tamera Townsend-Berger, Arley Smith.

Other Attendees: Harold Belisle, REO; Wayne Elliott, Eugene BLM; Chris Pazzula, Mt Hood NF; Mark Lawrence, Dick Prather, Salem BLM; Brad Levitt, Brian McGinley, Donna Short, Todd Bucholz, Sweet Home RD; Jim Williams, South end District; Peter Watt, Willamette Valley Livability Forum.

MEETING MINUTES

Willamette Valley Livability Forum (Peter Watt) -The WVLF is comprised of 88 Willamette Valley citizens brought together by Governor Kitzhaber to find and promote collaborative solutions to the growth and development issues facing Willamette Valley communities. Mr. Watt made a presentation explaining in greater detail the goals and objectives of the Forum, accomplishments to date and their projected schedule or timeline. Follow up questions and discussion with PAC members clarified how the Forum and the PAC could most effectively interact to accomplish common goals.

Objectives of the WVLF: Sharing information, Making Connections, Building a Vision.

The goal of the forum is to produce a Vision of the Willamette Valley for the next 50 years with the expectation that this vision will influence decision makers at all levels in the Valley (state, county, community) as they make policy decisions affecting development and growth. The schedule is to complete this Vision statement/document by June 2000.

Darrel Kenops and Denis Williamson are ex-officio Forum members representing federal land managers and Mark Lawrence is a member of the Resource Task Force or subcommittee of the Forum.

Questions and comments raised by PAC members:

- Concern that the membership on the Forum does not adequately represent agriculture and timber production in the Willamette Valley.
- Most of the valley population is urban and the values are increasingly reflect urban values and the values of rural residents (including smaller communities) are overshadowed. Non-

urban areas are increasingly looked at as their primary purpose is to provide benefits for the urban populations (recreation, pristine watersheds) rather than areas to produce agricultural commodities.

PAC Discussion:

The economic recovery strategy for the Northwest Forest Plan involved more than just the Federal land and natural resource agencies. The Department of Labor and the Small Business Administration just to name two, were major players in providing direct economic assistance at the regional and local levels to encourage economic recovery and growth. It would be good to get a follow up speaker(s) at a future PAC meeting that could describe the broader picture of economic assistance programs and what they have accomplished.

WALDO BASIN – SUBCOMMITTEE PROPOSAL (Jim Williams, Brian McGinley)

The Willamette National Forest, in response to on-going issues and concerns, is proposing a planning and assessment project for Waldo Lake it's surrounding basin area. The assessment will address water quality, relationships between human use and water quality and social issues associated with recreation use on and around the lake. After reviewing the scale and scope of these issues and the level of public interest, the Forest proposes that a collaborative planning approach with the participation of the Willamette PAC (both directly and through subcommittee) is more likely to succeed than traditional Forest Service planning processes. The specific proposal is for the PAC to authorize/create a subcommittee that would spend 14-16 months working through the various issues and propose a management strategy to the Forest Service. The subcommittee membership would include a few PAC members and/or their delegated representative and individuals that represent major users and constituents of Waldo Lake and the basin.

PAC Discussion:

- Concern about the ability for the entire PAC to be informed enough about the process and recommendations because of the intensity of the subcommittee work that is proposed and the length of time that it will be occurring.
- Many of the current PAC members appointments will expire at the end of this calendar year. That could present a problem for continuity through the process, PAC members being knowledgeable of the issues and background.
- Most PAC members will not have the time to be personally involved in the subcommittee process because of the number of additional meetings that are envisioned.
- Not sure exactly what the scope or depth of issues are based on information that is available. That makes it difficult to decide how to be involved or to provide feedback on potential PAC involvement.

PAC DECISION (Consensus based on polling of the members in attendance by the PAC Chair) **The Willamette PAC supports and agrees to the formation of a PAC subcommittee to work on the Waldo Lake issues as presented.** The PAC wants periodic updates and interaction with the subcommittee (or representatives) at regularly scheduled PAC meetings so that the entire PAC can follow the development of issues and recommendations and provide feedback during the process, not just be presented with a final recommendation at the end. PAC members interested in participating on the subcommittee (or identifying someone to represent them) should contact Neal Forrester by May 1. Notices and schedules of all subcommittee meetings will be sent to PAC members.

WILLAMETTE PROVINCE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Committee Meeting Notes
February 17, 2000
Salem BLM District Office

Leadership Announcement – Julia Dougan, Associate District Manager Eugene BLM will serve as the Willamette PAC Chair for the next several months while Denis Williamson, Eugene BLM District Manager is filling in as District Manager at the Salem BLM District. Darrel Kenops, Willamette National Forest Supervisor will continue to be the alternate PAC Chair for the remainder of the 2000.

Attendance:

PAC Members – Julia Dougan, Darrel Kenops, Dave Schmidt, Wade Stampe, Ginny Van Loo, John Davis, Peter Wakeland (for Cliff Adams), Cole Gardiner, Jim Zelenka, Jim Thrailkill (for Dana Erickson), and Wayne Giesy. Neal Forrester, DFO.

Others in attendance – Rob Iwamoto, Willamette National Forest, Harold Belisle, REO, Scott Abdon, Salem BLM.

Meeting Notes

PAC Agendas for 2000

Neal Forrester, DFO presented the proposed agenda topics survey results. The committee reviewed a proposed outline of meeting dates and topics for the remainder of 2000. The significant modification to the proposed schedule was the addition of a July 20 meeting to deal with several important topics that will be coming before the committee this summer. The modified meeting schedule was adopted by consensus. (Copy of schedule enclosed)

Information Sharing

Cole Gardiner – Attended Pacific Gas and Electric relicensing meeting and was impressed with the forthrightness of National Marine Fisheries Service presentation on what project modifications would be required to protect fisheries. He is also involved again this year with planting trees on private lands (stream banks, abandoned pasture lands) in the Clackamas River watershed as part of the Watershed Council's restoration efforts.

Jim Zelenka – Shared two handouts with the group. First, the Annual Report of the Cascade Pacific Resource Conservation and Development Council and second a summary of the Oregon Resource Conservation and Development Councils and Project Activities. Both publications provide good overviews of how the RC&D Councils are working to achieve the natural resource and community goals in the Willamette Province and the State as a whole.

Jim Thrailkill – Plans are underway for an October statewide meeting of watershed councils and soil and water conservation districts. Topics at the meeting will include examples and lessons learned from restoration projects, watershed council

liability issues, the need for and potential sources of technical support. OWED is working on a framework for watershed councils to use when planning projects that should be useful to the councils.

Wayne Giesy – Shared information on the status of the lawsuit brought by local organization against the National Marine Fisheries Service over the management of hatchery fish in the Alsea River. The group does not agree with the policy/practice of killing large numbers of returning hatchery adults. Also attended one of the NFMS public meetings on the proposed 4d rule and noted that a large number of people attending had serious concerns with the agency's plan.

Scott Abdom – The Salem BLM recently has become more active in the proposed 4d rule and its implementation in the Bull Run/Little Sandy River watershed. Part of the reason for the increased involvement is the BLM's role in a proposed land exchange in the watershed. The proposed rule is a major issue/concern for the City of Portland and how it will interact with management of the watershed as a municipal water supply. As a result of this concern, the city has proposed a policy level working group of federal, state, and local agencies to discuss Sandy River basin issues. The policy group will advise a technical working group (biologists and others). The ultimate goal is a Habitat Conservation Plan for the basin.

John Davis – On-going and upcoming issues that affect the province are the lynx listing and the coastal cutthroat trout proposed listing and change from NMFS to USFWS. The State Director's position has been filled (Kemper McMaster) and will be reporting in mid to late March. Once he is on-board, other vacancies in the State Office will be filled.

Julia Dougan – Distributed handouts for Paul Jeske, River Navigator for the American Heritage River program on the Willamette.

Harold Belisle – At the last IAC/RIEC meeting, the proposal for a joint PACs and IAC meeting was tabled because of the large cost to the Forest Service. However, several IAC members were still interested in pursuing ways to improve communication with the PACs. The proposals include, more active REO participation on the PACs (letter coming from RIEC soon with REO member assignment by PAC), several IAC members meeting with individual PACs at the PAC meetings, or individual IAC members meeting with PACs if agenda topics are pertinent to their area of responsibility or expertise.

On monitoring, a regional monitoring team is being set up. Al Horton, Forest Service, will be heading up the implementation monitoring for 2000 and there is still time to get suggestions to him. Dave Bush has also offered to provide an update to the PAC on the overall monitoring program.

Ginny Van Loo – Clackamas County forum for ESA compliance has begun to meet. The next forum meeting will include groups outside the county government. One of the biggest or most immediate issues facing the county is the issue of culverts and fish passage.

Darrel Kenops – Introduced Rob Iwamoto, Deputy Forest Supervisor on the Willamette National Forest who has been here for about 3 months. Shared information on an emerging controversy on the Forest, the Warner Creek Fire Process RNA, specifically the timeframe and resource availability for doing the analysis and NEPA documentation required to make a significant amendment or revision to the Willamette National Forest Plan. Was in Washington DC in December briefing the WO and congressional staff on the quality jobs program.

Wade Stampe – The Corps of Engineers has submitted a Biological Assessment to the USFWS and NFMS for the Corps Willamette Basin projects. This is the first step in getting a Biological Opinion.

Dave Schmidt – The proposed 4d rule for listed fish has been a major topic at the county government level. Also, Scio, a small town in Linn County, has been flooded several times in the past decade. The Corps of Engineers is working with Scio on a flood control study.

Public Forum

Several persons connected with the special forest products (or nontimber forest resources) industry were on hand to address the PAC. Their interest in speaking to the PAC was a provision in the fiscal year 2000 interior appropriation bill that directed the Forest Service to make significant changes in how special forest products are sold and how the funds collect from the sale of these products are used. The speakers specific concerns included: surprise by the law and concerned that the people most affected were not involved, concern about how the fair market value would be established, the lack of adequate science and basic knowledge to determine sustainability, and concern about how the funds from the sale of the products would be used. Persons addressing the PAC were Kathy Patterson, Rebecca McLain, Eric Jones, and Arlie Smith. Their request to the PAC was to contact the Secretary of Agriculture and request involvement as the Forest Service goes about writing the regulations and policy to implement the provisions in the appropriations act.

After discussion among the PAC members, the following course of action was approved. First, Arlie Smith will send a letter to the PAC documenting the group's issues and concerns with the new special forest products laws. Second, after receiving this letter, Darrel will draft a letter to the Secretary from the PAC requesting a waiver so the special forest products businesses can continue to operate under current policy and direction until the details of the new legislation are sorted out. Third, the Forest Service will check with the Washington Office on what the timetable is for writing the regulations and agency policy for implementing the legislation.

Payments to Counties, Receipts from Federal Lands Issue Update

Dave Schmidt shared what he knew about the status of legislation currently pending in Congress regarding payments to counties. Tom Haswell noted several provisions in the legislation Dave was discussing were controversial and it was being opposed by several environmental organizations.

Rechartering and Membership

Neal Forrester shared with the group that the IAC and PAC charter expires later this year. The Regional Office has started gathering the information necessary to recharter the committees. PAC members that will exceed six years of membership will need a special waiver. More information on this will follow in the coming months.

PAC Comments on Forest Service revised planning regulations

The subcommittee on the proposed revision to the planning regulations met twice, once in December and again in January. The consolidated comments were sent to the team working on the regulations. Since the entire PAC was not involved the comments were described as a collection of comments of individual PAC members, were not a consensus of the committee, and did not reflect the views of all the members.

Survey and Manage Draft EIS Comments

The PAC reviewed comments proposed by the subcommittee assigned to this task. The group discussed each individual comment. Each member present at the meeting was asked for his or her thoughts on the comments and to propose modifications or additions. After discussion, the group decided if there was a consensus each individual comment. If not, they moved on to discuss the next comment. The overall outcome was five comments with group consensus and two comments that the group could not reach consensus on. The final comments have been forwarded to the EIS Team and the RIEC. (Copy enclosed)

Waldo Lake Basin Recommendations

The subcommittee on the Waldo Lake basin issues that was formed in the fall of 1998 presented their recommendations to the PAC. The subcommittee dealt with seven issue categories and was able to arrive at consensus recommendations on five categories. On the other two issues, the subcommittee had arrived at recommendations that had support from a majority of the subcommittee, but not the consensus of the all members. The PAC discussed the recommendations and arrived at a consensus decision to forward the subcommittees recommendations for the five issue categories as submitted to the Willamette National Forest officials. The PAC did not feel that they could arrive at a consensus on the remaining two issues. Those issues were forwarded those issues to the Willamette officials with the subcommittee's comments and an understanding that the Forest would continue to pursue a decision on those issues through a NEPA process with public involvement.

Issue categories with consensus recommendations were: Charlton Tie Road Issue, Waldo Lake Recreation Opportunity Spectrum Classification Issue, Dispersed Recreation Site Management Issue, Nonnative Fish Issue and Outfitter Guide Permit Allocation Issue.

The issue categories where a consensus recommendation was not reached were: Boat Motor Issue and Snowmobile Issue.

Members of the Waldo subcommittee present at the meeting: Bob Bumstead, Gary Guttormsen, Bud Baumgartner, Joni Mogstad, and Wayne Schuyler. Also attending were

Jim Williams, recreation staff Middle Fork Ranger District, Willamette NF, Rick Scott, District Ranger, Middle Fork RD, and Brian McGinley, Sweet Home RD Willamette NF (subcommittee facilitator).

The meeting was adjourned at 3:45.

Re: Waldo Basin Subcommittee Recommendations

To: Darrel Kenops, Forest Supervisor, Willamette National Forest
Rick Scott, District Ranger, Middle Fork Ranger District

In the fall of 1998, the Willamette Province Advisory Committee (PAC) agreed to form a subcommittee to review a variety of management issues in the Waldo Lake Basin on the Willamette National Forest with the objective of providing advice and recommendations on those issues to the Forest. On February 17 2000, the subcommittee presented the results of their work to the PAC. The PAC has reviewed the enclosed subcommittee recommendations concerning the management issues in the Waldo Lake Basin and pass them on to the Willamette National Forest as follows.

The PAC concurs with those issues that the subcommittee reached consensus on and adopts those recommendations as presented. This includes the issue categories: Charlton Tie Road, Waldo Lake Recreation Opportunity Spectrum Classification, Dispersed Recreation Site Management and Outfitter and Guide Permit Allocation.

The PAC accepts the subcommittee's report on the two issue categories where consensus was not reached on a single set of recommendations. This is the Boat Motor Issue and the Snowmobile Issue. The PAC's recommendation is that the Willamette National Forest officials use the subcommittee's work on these issues as a beginning point for further analysis and public involvement through the NEPA process. The PAC will consider reviewing the NEPA analysis and documentation on these issues and providing advice if requested by the Forest.

On behalf of the PAC, I wish to express my appreciation to the members of the subcommittee for their work and Forest Service staff that provided the logistical support for the subcommittee. The final report and recommendations and presentation to the PAC were well done and are indicative of the time and energy that obviously went into this effort.

Julia Dougan
Acting District Manager Eugene BLM
Willamette Province Advisory Committee Chair

Waldo Subcommittee Recommendations

The following is a synthesis of the many hours that the Waldo Subcommittee spent on seven assigned resource issues in the Waldo Lake basin. The subcommittee was formed by the Willamette Province Advisory Council (PAC) to investigate management options around this resource issues and submit recommendations for the Forest Service to consider. The subcommittee was also able to reach consensus on recommendations for all but two issues (*boat motors on the lake* and *off-road snowmobile use*). As the group agreed, when consensus cannot be reached, recommendations with the greatest support would be presented with a description of support and concerns from the subcommittee.

Issue Summaries

Charlton Tie Road: What type of road surface and maintenance level should the Willamette and Deschutes National Forests chose for the Charlton Tie Road, which connects the Waldo Lake Road to the Cascade Lakes Highway?

Currently the Charlton Tie Road is mostly a rough, cinder/gravel road that receives periodic maintenance in the form of clearing winter storm damage and periodic surface grading.

The subcommittee considered options ranging from a two-lane paved road maintained every year to a more primitive road then current conditions.

Recommendations:

- Continue managing this road at its current condition and level, which is a rough cinder/gravel surfaced road with periodic maintenance.
- Seek funding opportunities to narrow the road right of way, particularly at the junction with the Waldo Lake road.
- Consensus was reached with twelve (12) members.

Rationale:

- Waldo Lake is relatively unique as a large Cascades lake with limited access. Visitors treat Waldo Lake as a destination site rather than one stop along an itinerary. Improving the Charlton Tie road would change this recreation setting and visitor experience, and diminish the uniqueness of Waldo Lake.
- Having one main access point into the Waldo Lake basin allows the Forest Service to more effectively reach visitors with an education program aimed at protecting Waldo Lake.
- Impacts from growing use levels are starting to show at Waldo Lake. Improving the Charlton Tie road would only be encouraging more use and requisite impacts.
- An improved Charlton Tie road would increase through-traffic to the Cascade Lakes highway, not only bringing more traffic, road hazards and pollution into the Waldo Lake basin; but also possibly changing how people use the Waldo Lake area. Most Waldo visitors are overnight visitors seeking a primitive experience around a large lake. Day users may come seeking different goals.

- Significant money will be required to improve this road and to maintain it once it is improved. The subcommittee prefers to see limited road budgets allocated to rehabilitate the wide road right of way, rather than to improve the road surface. The right of way was originally created wide with expectations for constructing a paved highway. This wide right of way is no longer needed.
- Subcommittee members felt that even modest road surface improvements would begin the process of incremental change toward major future road change, eventually resulting in a paved road. Crescent Junction Cutoff road is a prime example of a cinder forest road that evolved in such a way.
- Finally, a lower standard road was considered and rejected because it would fail to adequately serve the trailheads on both forests.

Waldo Lake ROS Classification: Recreation Opportunity Spectrum (ROS) is a land-based classification system used to guide decisions on resource development and visitor use levels toward identified goals defining the desired recreation setting and visitor experiences.

Waldo Lake was assigned a default ROS class of “*Roaded Natural*” by the 1990 Willamette National Forest Land and Resource Management Plan. This ROS class represents a majority of landscape settings on the Willamette National Forest, and allows most forms of development (campgrounds, roads, signs, harvest units, boat launches, and buildings) and sets low expectations for visitor solitude and self-reliance.

The subcommittee was asked to consider the expectations and desires of most Waldo Lake visitors (relative to recreation setting, level of development and uses, and their experiences) and determine if the current ROS class is appropriate for the lake surface, or if another ROS class would be a better management guide.

Recommendations:

- The subcommittee recommends changing the lake surface’s Recreation Opportunity Spectrum (ROS) class from the current “*Roaded Natural*” to “*Semi-Primitive*”.
- The change in ROS should be compatible with decisions made on the boat motor issue. Further distinction of the ROS as “*motorized*” or “*non-Motorized*” will occur through resolution of the boat motor issue.
- Consensus was reached with thirteen (13) members.

Rationale:

- Waldo Lake is a unique recreation experience, due to its large size and primitive nature outside of campgrounds. Most visitors appreciate and are attracted to these conditions when they visit Waldo Lake. Most visitors would like to see the natural ambiance at Waldo Lake maintained or enhanced over time.
- While subcommittee members felt concerned over the ability to meet social objectives of a *Semi-Primitive* ROS on some parts of the lake surface, we agreed in general that this ROS provides better management guidance to the district than a *Roaded Natural* ROS.

- Generally, most of the lake surface currently meets a *Semi-Primitive* ROS, and making this change simply highlights the importance of protecting Waldo's uniqueness as use levels increase in the future.
- The ROS change should recognize the inherent need for transition zones around the three campgrounds and their boat launches on the lake's east shore. At these interfaces, the subcommittee recognizes the difficulties of meeting the social objectives of a *Semi-Primitive* ROS for the lake surface.

Dispersed Site Management: Semi-primitive lakeshore dispersed campsites, accessible by boat, attract thousands of visitors annually to Waldo Lake. Such use has established up to 52 dispersed campsites (identified by campfire rings, barren core areas, vegetation loss, damaged trees, and user trails from the lakeshore). Several other campsites have been created, used very little over time, and quickly reclaimed by nature.

The increasing level of recreation use is creating physical impacts to shoreline resources, and more social conflicts among visitors particularly on heavy use weekends (August and September). Use levels Waldo Lake can be expected to increase over the next 20 years as population levels in neighboring (within 200 miles) urban centers grow.

Managing social impacts is more difficult on lake surfaces, where human sights and sounds carry so well and where visitors insist on camping close to the shoreline. These user conflicts are complicated by high visitor expectations for few interactions with others and an agency mission to meet a *Semi-Primitive* ROS setting.

The subcommittee was asked to develop strategies for managing user impacts (both physical and social) currently being seen along the lakeshore assuming an existing ROS setting of *Semi-Primitive* for the shoreline.

Recommendations:

Phase 1

- Develop a visitor education program that promotes *Leave No Trace* camping behavior around the lakeshore.
- Discourage the building of new campfire rings within 200 feet of the lake.
- Evaluate existing campfire locations at dispersed sites, and move or obliterate campfire pits according to resource needs.
- Open up the north shore to camping, but ban open campfires until resource conditions have suitably recovered.
- Close three sites conflicting with the North Waldo campground.
- Limit group size to 12 people per dispersed site.
- Establish the following thresholds for changes in site conditions, and monitor site conditions. If thresholds are exceeded, then implement the next phase of recommendations.
 - Monitoring Thresholds:
 - Net increase of 5 established dispersed sites around the lake, *or*
 - Net increase in the cumulative barren core area of existing sites by 20%.

Phase 2

- If Phase 1 thresholds are exceeded, implement the following restrictions.

- Restrict all camping within 200 feet of lakeshore to designated and marked sites
- Post information maps at boat launches to identify designated sites
- Continue monitoring sites for further change

Phase 3

- If conditions still do not improve over time, through site rehab and Phase 2 restrictions; implement further restriction of use
 - Limited entry/reservation system for dispersed campsites.
- Consensus was reached with twelve (12) members.

Rationale:

- Dispersed camping causes physical resource impacts along the lakeshore, such as vegetation loss, damage to trees, exposure of bare soil to erosion, and loss of downed woody material from campfires. While such impacts are noticeable and disturbing, the total impact from the 51 established sites is relatively small on a watershed scale (even when comparing it to just riparian reserve acres around the lake).
- The subcommittee is more concerned with the social effects that these impacts and connected use have on visitors to Waldo Lake. Most visitors come to the area to enjoy a semi-primitive experience, free from excessive human impacts or presence. Our recommendations aim to maintain or improve a semi-primitive recreation experience (outside of the campgrounds).
- Reaching out to visitors to inform them of appropriate behavior is the foundation of managing recreation use impacts. Promoting a ***Leave-No-Trace*** camping attitude around the lake will help maintain the pristine character of the lakeshore, without unduly restricting people's behavior.
- Campfires were recognized as the focal point around most human impacts created at dispersed sites, and contrary to ***Leave-No-Trace*** camping ethics. Once fire rings become established at a site, the site becomes easier to discover and reuse. Our strategy focuses on campfires as a regulating and monitoring device for these reasons.
- While we do not want more dispersed sites being established around the lakeshore, we recognized more user capacity was possible with little impact to resources or other visitors, if more folks use ***Leave-No-Trace*** camping techniques.
- We also recognized that many of the social impacts were created by visitors camping close too the lakeshore, in the form of visual and sound disturbance. Therefore, our concern for dispersed site creation was primarily focused within 200 feet of the lakeshore.
- Clearly some established sites were poorly located and needed rehab work or relocation. Forest Service staff will need to review all sites and remedy specific problem areas where appropriate. In some cases, this may result in the closure of a site if effects to resources are unacceptable.
- Potential camping impacts along the north shore (in the burn area) were not seen as a large enough concern to continue the camping closure for another year.

However, maintaining a campfire ban to guard against fire hazards from abandon campfires in this area seemed like a prudent precaution.

- Establishing a monitoring system with thresholds for measuring success is a critical step for managing the social impacts of dispersed camping use. Once again site establishment is the proxy for measuring these social impacts.
- Defining a second phase of action (further restrictions) seemed sensible for any serious public campaign to change recreation behavior. Visitors must recognize the benefits of proposed changes to their recreation experiences at Waldo Lake, but also the consequences if conditions deteriorate beyond the stated thresholds.
- Three sites next to North Waldo campground should be closed because they directly compete with the developed campground sites. Such closures are common for dispersed sites within close walking distance of campgrounds.
- Dispersed site impacts (physical and social) generally grow exponentially with large groups of people. Semi-primitive recreation settings are difficult to maintain when large groups of people are involved. Therefore, a group size limit was suggested (similar to the wilderness standards) to manage the physical impacts at specific sites, and the social impacts that large groups cause to their neighbors.
- Finally, trying to control site development along the lakeshore allows the district to maintain attractive and pristine camping options for visitors who prefer camping without firerings and associated impacts.

Outfitter/Guide Permit Allocation: The district has issued twelve (12) special use permits in the Waldo Lake area with most of the use occurring between June and September. Each year the district receives additional requests for permits from other outfitters. Prior to approving more permits, the district wants to assess the public need for such services at the Waldo Lake, and the impacts such commercial use may have on public visitors (Needs Assessment).

Generally special use permits are denied if the proposed activity can be accommodated on private lands, or if it creates unacceptable conflicts with the visiting public. A permit may also be denied if perceived resource impacts caused by the activity are unacceptable.

The subcommittee was asked to review the current permit situation and develop guidelines for issuing and managing additional permits, if they found that Waldo Lake could sustain additional permitted activity.

Recommendations:

- No new O/G permits for dispersed camping (between the lakeshore and Waldo Lake trail) should be approved between August 1st and September 15th.
- No new O/G bicycle permits on the Waldo Lake trail should be approved between May 1st and September 15th.
- Permits involving the Waldo Lake trail should only be approved if use of the trail is incidental to a larger trip, such that the Waldo Lake trail is a connective link critical to the entire route.
- Permit holders should not be allowed to use the campgrounds between August 15th and September 15th.

- Permit requests outside of the above constraints will be approved on a case by case basis and subject to the following conditions:
 - Group sizes will be restricted to 12 persons, including the group leaders.
 - Camping will be restricted to established & hardened sites.
 - Camping groups will be required to provide and use porta-potties.
- Existing permits will fall under the same conditions as new permits when they come up for renewal (except that their season of use will continue to be honored).
- Permit holders will be required to promote *Leave No Trace* techniques to their clients.
- Permitted use levels and these restrictions will be monitored for ten years to assess whether recreation goals and recreation protection needs are being met.
- Consensus was reached with eight (8) members.

Rationale:

- A general philosophy guiding our thoughts is that O/G permitted use should not unduly compete with public visitors at Waldo Lake. Surveys and campground records show that public use is close to capacity levels during the months of August and September. Therefore, allowing more permits during this prime part of the season did not seem prudent.
- Trail use around the lake, particularly mountain biking, is growing tremendously with impacts being felt in physical and psychological ways. Given our goals for a semi- primitive recreation experience and existing use levels, more permitted bicycle use should not be encouraged.
- While the subcommittee did not favor more permitted use on the Waldo Lake trail, we recognized this trail connected to other trails in the basin and watershed. In some cases, a permittee may need to use the Waldo Lake trail as a link in a larger trip, and if no other options are available such use should be permitted.
- Outside of the prime recreation season, the district should encourage permittees to use developed campgrounds as a way of concentrating use on hardened sites with facilities. This strategy will help minimize impacts to dispersed sites and campers. However, to avoid competing with the visiting public, permittees should be steered away from campgrounds during the busiest months of the summer.
- Pre-selecting established or hardened dispersed sites suitable for the specific group size will help manage resource impacts, and hopefully provide a positive experience for the permitted clients.
- Clearly group size has an effect on the impacts the group may create at a site or impart to its nearest neighbors. In order to manage these impacts, permitted groups should be restricted to 12 persons. Larger groups can be split into subgroups at separate sites. Such limits will help to keep dispersed sites from growing, and limit the social impacts that large parties can create.
- More and more throughout the country, permittees are being asked to manage the human waste created by their clients, particularly in settings involving rivers and lakes. Because of the high water quality at Waldo Lake and growing use levels around the lake, it is time for permittees that are dispersed camping to provide

porta potties for clients. Most permittees access sites by boat making the facility transport and management a practical matter.

- Education is and will continue to be the most effective tool for creating change in our visitors at Waldo Lake. Our permittees are some of the most responsible users and best examples for others to follow. It stands to reason that they can be excellent ambassadors for promoting *Leave No Trace* behavior. Many of them practice these techniques already.
- In order to treat all permitted users equitably, existing permit holders should follow the same restrictions as new permittees. For ease of implementation, such changes should be voluntary until permit renewal, and mandatory under the revised permit.

Boat Motors: For many reasons, Waldo Lake attracts lots of visitors for boating pleasure. Current boating regulations restrict motorized boat speeds to less than 10 mph. This restriction discourages many boaters typically attracted to a lake as large as Waldo Lake (6672 acres). The largest boats tend to be sailboats taking advantage of stiff afternoon winds, but occasionally a cabin cruiser or houseboat will visit the lake. Most boaters (85%+) use small, non-motorized craft.

Public concern over water quality in one of the world's cleanest lakes and the desire of many visitors for a semi-primitive recreation setting are two major rationale driving the debate about the presence of boat motors on Waldo Lake. Surveys show users of boat motors represent a small proportion of total boating visitors, but their presence does not go unnoticed.

The subcommittee was asked to look at boat motor options and their consequences to all lake users and to Waldo Lake.

Recommendations:

- Limit boat motor use to electric-motors-only starting in 2005.
- Use an aggressive education program to inform the public about the motor use change to help the transition.
- Use free mandatory permits for boat users to collect user information.
- Allow exceptions for search & rescue, fire suppression, law enforcement, and approved research.
- Consensus was NOT reached on this issue. Nine members (9) supported the recommendations, and three members (3) did not support the recommendations. The Oregon State Marine Board, Sailboat, and Motorboat representatives were members that did not support these recommendations.

Rationale Supporting Recommendations

- Most lake visitors desire and anticipate a peaceful, semi-primitive setting outside of developed campgrounds.
- Internal combustion boat motors do not blend well with the recreation experience that most visitors (outside of campgrounds) at Waldo Lake come to enjoy.

- Some visitors need power assistance to enjoy Waldo Lake, and we believe electric motors can fill their need.
- This restriction should not substantially reduce the ability of Americans with disabilities to recreate on Waldo Lake. Boaters with special disabilities have successfully been able to boat on lakes with internal combustion engines ban (Gold Lake).
- All but the largest boats can be successfully powered by existing electric motor technology, so very few users would be affected by this change.
- Postponing motor restrictions until 2005 will help visitors to transition to different motor options, and electric technology options are likely to increase for larger boats (>18 feet) and for longer duration trips.
- Electric motors are a less expensive motor option than some of the newer quieter, less polluting internal combustion engines.
- Providing a phase-in period should help those who are economically burdened by giving them more time to transition to a different motor option.
- Public support for this management change may improve through a focused user education program at the lake that focuses on all user behavior and the unique character of the Waldo Lake basin. If this change is seen in the context of a larger strategy of changes, acceptance may grow.
- Using a permit system during the transition period and beyond 2005 will provide a valuable understanding of how our management actions affect visitor use patterns and ultimately recreation setting. Having such a monitoring plan helps us assess whether we are successful with our decisions.
- Although studies have not been done to show that internal combustion engines are affecting water quality at Waldo Lake, such engines clearly discharge pollutants into the water and air. Several subcommittee members are concerned about the potential future impacts from these pollutants if motor use patterns are allowed to continue.

Rationale Against Recommendations:

- We have safety concerns over the inadequate power of electric motors, particularly in the rough water or bad weather that occurs on Waldo Lake.
- Some boaters will be excluded from Waldo Lake because their boats are too large for the current electric motor technology.
- Forcing visitors to transition to other motor options will place an economic burden on them that may be difficult to absorb, notably some local users.
- The electric charge on marine batteries may not last all week/weekend. The noise of generators recharging batteries around the lake may be replacing the noise of gas powered boat motors.
- These recommendations exclude a minority user group for the benefits of the majority. A solution should focus on meeting everyone's needs.
- Changing the visitors' behavior (through voluntary compliance and education) that is connected to the user conflict should be attempted first before the agency adopts stricter regulations.

- This boat motor change will raise challenges for visitors with physical disabilities, either because they won't be able to paddle a self propelled boat or simply because they won't be able to climb into a smaller boat with an electric motor.
- We should immediately begin addressing pollution and noise concerns with a 10 hp limit and 4 cycle engine requirement, in coordination with our user education program and not wait until 2005. As motor technologies improvements are made we can adjust our restrictions to protect the lake as much as possible.
- The recommendations are not appropriately based on data or standards that characterize the social context framing the true issues. Much of the group's early discussions focused on environmental concerns of boat motors, but supporting data was lacking to manage boat motors around these concerns. As such environmental concerns were not included as rationale for these final recommendations. Similarly, adequate data on the social conflicts is also not available to support these recommendations. Aside from anecdotal comments and complaints, no effort to specifically frame the social issues through surveys or to collect data regarding attitudes and opinions about the issues or potential solutions has been undertaken. Standards for social carrying capacities have also not been thoroughly researched, proposed, established or discussed by the agency or this committee. Lacking these basic data and standards, the Marine Board believes the recommendations would be seen as arbitrary and impossible to defend as good public policy.
- The approach taken in crafting recommendations on this issue was different than with other issues. For most other issues, recommendations support status quo use patterns or prescribe rational controls or limits. Users of gasoline-powered boats (being a status quo use) would be precluded from using Waldo Lake under these recommendations. Considering the other options available to reduce engine noise, the subcommittee's recommendations seem excessively proscriptive against one single user group.
- The Marine Board is willing to work with the Forest Service to explore alternative approaches that would systematically define the problem and establish standards and measures against which a tailored regulatory remedy could be crafted, if regulation is needed. As the state boating agency we are unable to support these recommendations as crafted in light of existing state laws and the lack of supporting data.

Off-road Snowmobile Access: Prior to 1990, local snowmobile riders were free to run their machines in the Waldo Lake basin if they chose. Some riders would even try to make it to the top of The Twins, east of Waldo Lake road. Land allocation changes created by the 1990 Willamette Forest Land and Resource Management Plan unintentionally ended this group's fun while trying to regulate summer off-road vehicle use in the basin.

Although the land allocation change was not focused on winter recreation sports, it had negative consequences for existing users. The subcommittee was asked to review this change to validate its application to winter recreation vehicles.

Specifically they were asked whether snowmobiles should be allowed off-road east of Waldo Lake road, between the Bobby Lake trail and Charlton Tie Road (only on the Willamette National Forest, the adjacent Deschutes National Forest is already open).

Recommendations:

- In considering whether to change the Forest Plan to allow snowmobiles off-road east of the Waldo Lake road between the Bobby Lake trail and Charlton Tie road, the subcommittee believes snowmobile use should remain restricted to roadways.
- Consensus was NOT reached on this issue. Ten (10) members supported the recommendations and two (2) Snowmobile reps did not support the recommendations. Two of the supporting members did have some reservation in their support for these recommendations.

Rationale Supporting Recommendations:

- The area being considered is part of one of the largest roadless areas on the forest; which will be reviewed in a national roadless area review process. Many subcommittee members feel now is not the time to propose changing the area's administrative status from *semi-primitive non-motorized* to *semi-primitive motorized*.
- The basin currently receives very little snowmobile use, and this pattern is not likely to change much in the near future. Also the off-road area in question is not very attractive for most snowmobile users because dense forest makes travel difficult. In short, there appears to be no strong user-group interest to advocate for this change.
- In reviewing other options, the subcommittee considered opening up a narrow travel corridor roughly following the Bobby Lake trail. Such a corridor would allow access to eastside trail systems from the Waldo Lake snopark. The subcommittee rejected this proposal for a number of reasons.
 - The corridor would be difficult to maintain and manage, and may actually encourage more snowmobile use in the basin with little interest in Waldo Lake.
 - The Deschutes National Forest was not receptive to designating such a low standard (ungroomed) trail corridor.
 - Not enough interest from advocacy groups existed for the agency to invest the NEPA process energy on such a proposal.

Rationale Against Recommendations:

- It makes sense to have the same access management on two adjacent forests for similar land areas. There is no real difference in resources from one side of the forest boundary to the other. The Deschutes National Forest allows off road snowmobile use in this area; the Willamette National Forest should do the same.
- Reestablishing a local use pattern (off-road travel with snowmobiles) for people to pursue is appropriate, if no resources are being harmed.

- Not allowing off road travel only because it offends our sense of appropriate behavior (or because it's the way we have always managed snowmobiles) is not strong reasoning.

Non-Native Fish Populations: Since the late 1800's, private citizens and government agencies have been stocking non-native fish in Waldo Lake. Scientists believe that prior to these efforts Waldo Lake did not support a native fish population. The Oregon Department of Fish and Wildlife (*ODFW*) has only recently agreed to cancel the fish stocking program in Waldo Lake due to the politics of resource concerns.

These concerns over fish impacts on native aquatic species and nutrient cycling in the lake have brought forward the suggestion that non-native fish populations should be removed or controlled. The subcommittee was asked to review this issue, possible options for control, and their implications.

Recommendations:

- Continue current management of existing fish populations (*eg. No stocking and consumptive angling regulations*).
- Continue to monitor water quality and biological systems for changes. If research shows fish populations are substantially impacting these systems, then efforts to reduce fish populations should be made.
 - ODFW and USFS biologists agree that netting adult fish (mainly brook trout) during fall spawning season is the most effective means of population reduction. Netting is estimated to cost about \$7500 per year. After several years, netting may be necessary less often.
 - The ODFW Commission would need to approve any proposals for reducing fish populations.
- Consensus was reached on this issue, with nine (9) members.

Rationale:

- There is no clear evidence that fish populations in Waldo Lake are substantially impacting the natural system. Since a reduction in the fish population is the best result we can achieve and any reduction effort will be expensive, the agencies should have sound science to support this decision before it is made.
- The current fish populations are not large for Waldo Lake. While the fish are reproducing naturally, the total population is likely not increasing. The existing fish population also feeds mostly on insects, rather than amphibians or zooplankton. Therefore, waiting for better information before taking action is a low risk option to the natural systems.
- The brook trout provide a quality angling experience for a growing number of anglers during the spring and fall. Population control would eliminate this experience.
- A multi-agency effort is in process to assess and develop policies for managing the effects of non-native fish on native fauna in Oregon. There is value in delaying management changes until these broader policies are developed.